

ALBUQUERQUE BERNALILLO COUNTY  
WATER UTILITY AUTHORITY  
Wednesday, August 23, 2017 5:04 p.m.

ALBUQUERQUE BERNALILLO COUNTY GOVERNMENT CENTER  
ONE CIVIC PLAZA, NW  
ALBUQUERQUE, NM 87102

Before: Paul Baca  
PAUL BACA PROFESSIONAL COURT REPORTERS  
500 Fourth Street, NW, Suite 105  
Albuquerque, New Mexico 87102

A P P E A R A N C E S

COUNCILLOR KLARISSA PENA, Chair

COMMISSIONER DEBBIE O'MALLEY, Vice Chair

COUNCILLOR PAT DAVIS, Member

COUNCILLOR TRUDY JONES, Member

COMMISSIONER WAYNE JOHNSON, Member

COMMISSIONER MAGGIE HART STEBBINS, Member

TRUSTEE PABLO RAEL, Ex-officio Member (Excused)

MAYOR RICHARD BERRY, Member (Excused)

MR. ROB PERRY, Admin. Officer, Alternate Member

1           CHAIRWOMAN PENA: I call this August 23rd,  
2   2017, meeting of the Albuquerque Bernalillo County  
3   Water Authority Utility to order. Let the record  
4   show that Trustee Rael is excused.

5           Next item we have is invocation and  
6   Pledge of Allegiance. If you'll stand for a moment  
7   of silence and Pledge of Allegiance led by  
8   Councillor Jones. Thank you.

9           (Whereupon, there was a moment of  
10   silence.)

11          (Whereupon, the Pledge of Allegiance was  
12   led by Councillor Trudy Jones.)

13          CHAIRWOMAN PENA: Thank you.

14          Next item, we have approval of minutes.  
15   I make a motion to approve the June 21st, 2017,  
16   minutes. Is there a second?

17          COMMISSIONER O'MALLEY: Second.

18          CHAIRWOMAN PENA: There's a first -- a  
19   motion and a second. All those in favor, signify  
20   by saying yes.

21          ALL MEMBERS: Yes.

22          CHAIRWOMAN PENA: Opposed, no.

23          Next item -- motion passes.

24          (7-0 vote. Agenda Item 3 approved.)

25          CHAIRWOMAN PENA: Next item we have is

1 proclamation of -- proclamation and awards,  
2 quarterly employee incentive awards, my favorite  
3 time.

4 Certificates -- so the certificates are  
5 going to be handed out by the staff, correct?

6 Okay.

7 So if the employee is here to receive the  
8 award, please come forward when your name is  
9 called.

10 Joe Bailey and Edmund -- I don't even  
11 know how -- Patty, you want to give that one a  
12 shot.

13 MS. JENKINS: Cianchetti.

14 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: Cianchetti.

15 So as you're coming down -- should we  
16 call everybody up at the same time, do you think it  
17 would be better, or just individually?  
18 Individually?

19 Okay. So we'll go -- I'll start speaking  
20 for the first recipients. It's Joe and Edmund are  
21 recognized for saving ratepayers almost 38,000 by  
22 seeking alternative sources for rolling bed  
23 trailers at the soil amendment facility.

24 Boy, that's a significant -- that's a  
25 significant savings. Do you guys want to say a

1 couple words?

2 MR. CIANCHETTI: No. It's Cianchetti.

3 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: Cianchetti. Oh, thank  
4 you. Appreciate it.

5 I'm known to massacre these names, so...

6 Next recipient is Clifford Duldulao.

7 Clifford is going to be receiving a \$200 award,  
8 plus a certificate.

9 Clifford is recognized for going above  
10 and beyond in implementation of database  
11 virtualization and streamlining database processes  
12 which reduce the cost and manpower and improved  
13 disaster recovery.

14 Thank you. Do you want to say a couple  
15 words?

16 MR. DULDULAO: Tampoco.

17 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: Okay. Well, thank you.

18 The next two recipients will be receiving  
19 \$250 each, Rudy Apodaca and Cruz Padilla. Are they  
20 here? So they're not here. Anybody want their  
21 250?

22 So Cruz and Rudy are recognized for  
23 taking the initiative and implementing replacement  
24 of old-fashioned sodium bulb lighting with high  
25 efficiency LED throughout the Southside Water

1 Reclamation Plant, earning the utility a savings of  
2 27,000 -- a rebate of 27,000, 450. Pretty awesome.

3 So the next recipients are Leonard Aragon  
4 and Josh -- Joshua Towery. They will be receiving  
5 \$400, plus eight hours each.

6 Leonard and Joshua are recognized for  
7 their initiative in devising a way to build berms  
8 around critical facilities at the Alameda bridge  
9 diversion structure to prevent flooding of intake  
10 equipment during recent high river flows. Their  
11 resourcefulness ensured that the water authority  
12 could continue to treat and deliver surface water  
13 during the high demand period.

14 Congratulations. Do you want to say a  
15 couple words?

16 MR. TOWERY: Thank you very much. Yes. I  
17 appreciate it. I'm thankful for the authority and  
18 the incentive program. It really means a lot to me  
19 and those who receive these awards. And thank you.

20 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: And your name? I  
21 apologize. Because I know --

22 MR. TOWERY: Joshua Towery.

23 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: Joshua. Okay. Thank you,  
24 Josh.

25 MR. TOWERY: Thank you very much.

1           CHAIRWOMAN PENA: The next recipients are  
2   Ross Pino and Ernesto Padilla, \$200. Are they  
3   here? No?

4           Ross and Ernesto are recognized for going  
5   above and beyond their normal duties to prepare the  
6   San Juan-Chama Water Treatment Plant to transition  
7   to the new maximum amount of work order system.

8           Ross Pino, Ernesto Padilla, they're not  
9   here? Okay.

10          Ron Montano, Edward Chavez and Michael  
11   Williams, they will be receiving \$200 each. Are  
12   they here? So who is here? Ron? Edward?

13          MR. WILLIAMS: Williams. Ron and Mike.

14          THE COURT: Ron and Mike. So they're  
15   recognized for going above and beyond their normal  
16   duties to repair a vital piece of equipment at the  
17   surface water treatment plant by completing the  
18   repair themselves, instead of bringing in a  
19   contractor, as would typically be done in a job  
20   like this. These employees saved the ratepayers  
21   about \$30,000. Awesome.

22          MR. MONTANO: I'd like to take the  
23   opportunity -- I'm Ron Montano. This is Mike  
24   Williams. It was really Mike and Ed, though I  
25   coordinated ordering parts and stuff like that, and

1 did a little bit of labor myself. But, as a  
2 supervisor, you know, we're really lucky to have  
3 people like Mike and Ed to take care of these jobs.

4 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: Well, with good employees,  
5 you just got 200 bucks.

6 So next recipients are Benjamin  
7 Zimmerman, Mason Liang, Shaw Hardeman, and they  
8 will be receiving \$100 each.

9 Ben and Mason and Shaw are recognized for  
10 their quick action in extinguishing an abandoned  
11 campfire along the river near the Southside Water  
12 Reclamation Plant, preventing a potentially  
13 catastrophic bosque fire.

14 The next recipients are Henry Salazar,  
15 John Lovato, Trevor Currier, Gerald Duran and  
16 Javier Baca. And they're going to be receiving a  
17 hundred dollars each. Are they here?

18 These individuals are recognized for  
19 their respective roles in implementing an  
20 innovative LED lighting upgrade program for older  
21 groundwater, well and pump station facilities.

22 Next recipient is Joseph Herrera, and  
23 then it just says slash Hernandez. Are they here?  
24 They're not here, but they're getting \$400 and  
25 eight hours.

1           Joseph is recognized for his quick  
2   action -- oh, I guess that's one person.  
3   Recognized for his quick action in engaging his  
4   emergency lights to provide traffic control and  
5   helped two young children safely cross the street  
6   and avoid a fatality in the wake of an accident  
7   that disabled the traffic lights at a busy  
8   intersection.   Awesome.

9           Next recipient is Erin Keck.   She's going  
10   to be receiving \$400 and eight hours.   Erin is  
11   recognized for the summer internship she initiated  
12   for students enrolled in the job mentor program,  
13   which consisted of a six-week introduction to the  
14   water authority and opportunities to observe  
15   numerous job functions and staff over the course of  
16   the summer.

17           She coordinated this while maintaining  
18   her usual schedule, going above and beyond to  
19   ensure a life-changing experience for these  
20   students.

21           Thank you.   You want to say a couple  
22   words?   Are you sure?

23           So that's the last of our recipients.   If  
24   you guys all want to come up, we just all really  
25   want to congratulate you again and thank you for



1 your hard work and going above and beyond.

2 I'll just say, as you guys are walking  
3 up, kind of stole this program at the City of  
4 Albuquerque. We just had our fresh recipients on  
5 Monday. So thank you guys.

6 Councillor Jones reminded me that we  
7 don't have any money at the City of Albuquerque, so  
8 we don't give money. They just get the award.

9 Next item we have is public comment.

10 Patty, how many people, or who's going  
11 to -- okay. How many people are signed up to  
12 speak.

13 MS. JENKINS: Thirty-four.

14 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: Thirty-four? Okay. We  
15 want to get started.

16 I should mention that it will be -- you  
17 will have -- because there's more than 15 speakers,  
18 we're going to have two minutes to speak. And  
19 they'll alert you at a minute and a half.

20 MS. CARREON: Don Schrader, followed by  
21 Maggie Hertel.

22 MR. SCHRADER: I compliment three dental  
23 associations that oppose water fluoridation.

24 Albert Schatz, Ph.D., world renowned bio  
25 chemist said, "I am opposed to fluoridation because

1 of the overwhelming evidence that fluoridation is  
2 not only potentially harmful, but has already  
3 caused considerable, well-documented harm."

4 The manufacturer of sodium fluoride,  
5 Merck & Company, posed this on its containers,  
6 "Warning: May be fatal if inhaled or swallowed."

7 Sodium fluoride is an extremely poisonous  
8 industrial waste product. It never occurs in  
9 nature. Sodium fluoride is not the same as calcium  
10 fluoride found in nature.

11 The highly respected medical journal, The  
12 Lancet, in 2014 reported that fluoride is one of  
13 the neurotoxins that can cause children's  
14 developmental disabilities. See the universal  
15 symbol for a deadly poison, the skull and across  
16 bones on containers of sodium fluoride.

17 Vote against fluoridation to prevent a  
18 possible lawsuit for mass dosing this city with a  
19 toxic chemical many of us do not want.

20 Did most dentists for decades warn  
21 patients of the dangers of mercury in silver  
22 amalgam fillings? Many doctors prescribed for  
23 years drugs that were later recalled and banned.  
24 Even if fluoride reduces cavities, are you  
25 absolutely sure it has no dangerous side effects,

1 no unintended consequences to the rest of our  
2 bodies? Are you sure beyond all reasonable doubt  
3 that all the scientific studies, all the articles  
4 and books the past 50 years damning fluoridation  
5 are totally wrong? If you have any doubt, leave it  
6 out.

7 MS. CARREON: Maggie Hertel, followed by  
8 Dana Majewski.

9 MS. HERTEL: Hi. Thanks for letting us come  
10 here today to argue the point we don't want  
11 fluoride in our water. I also brought the article  
12 from The Lancet. And I'd like to make it clear  
13 that this is the most prestigious medical journal.  
14 The Lancet has officially classified fluoride as a  
15 neurotoxin, in the same category as arsenic, lead,  
16 and mercury.

17 Now, would we really be here if  
18 somebody -- to vote on putting more lead or mercury  
19 or arsenic in our water? Probably not. So why are  
20 we even considering fluoridating our water with a  
21 toxic substance that has been absolutely determined  
22 to be a neurotoxin?

23 I ask you, I beg of you, as you listen to  
24 everyone today, the story of fluoride pushers has  
25 not changed, but there has been more evidence

1 coming out about how toxic fluoride really is and  
2 how dangerous it is to our communities.

3 So I would really, really encourage you  
4 not to put a neurotoxin in our water supply. Thank  
5 you.

6 MS. CARREON: Dana Majewski, followed by  
7 Leland T. Tom Taylor.

8 MR. MAJEWSKI: Well, I'm speaking against it  
9 as well. And I want to bring to your attention a  
10 lawsuit that was filed in April of this year. And  
11 they basically say they are going to try to compel  
12 the initiation of rule making pursuant to the toxic  
13 substance control act to prohibit the addition of  
14 fluoridation chemicals to drinking water supplies.

15 I think it will be a good idea for you to  
16 delay any kind of action until after this lawsuit  
17 has been settled. Thank you.

18 MS. CARREON: Barbara Weber, followed by  
19 Michael Manzanares.

20 MR. TAYLOR: Back when the city was going to  
21 fluoridate the water before the authority took over  
22 the water supply, Dr. Bronner and my father opposed  
23 fluoridation. Dr. Bronner stayed at my house. A  
24 lot of people may be familiar with Dr. Bronner's  
25 Castile soap.

1           Anyhow, the next day, there was a big  
2   headline on the front page of the Albuquerque  
3   Journal saying fluoride opponent convicted of  
4   fraud. Well, he was never convicted of fraud. The  
5   FDA didn't like his labeling.

6           What is really interesting in the history  
7   of fluoridation is the City of Albuquerque did it  
8   at one time and has stopped doing it. Somebody  
9   asked the city why they did. Because it ate up  
10   their pipes. The people who were handling it get  
11   sick. It's very expensive. It would corrode the  
12   pumps, the valves.

13           It has no significant benefit. There is  
14   no proof that taking it internally has any benefit  
15   to the dentist pressure to put it in to reduce  
16   cavities. It accumulates in the body, it's  
17   extremely toxic. And you may one day be forced to  
18   remove fluorine from the water as similarly to the  
19   way you -- similarly to limiting arsenic. Fluoride  
20   has much more insidious poisoning effects than  
21   arsenic as a chemical.

22           So the question I really ask is, how is  
23   it that political bodies are so seriously  
24   influenced by whatever financial interests there  
25   are? We may be suffering from the bottled water

1 industry wanting to sell more bottled water because  
2 it doesn't have fluoride in it. Thank you.

3 MS. CARREON: Barbara, followed by Lynn  
4 Carroll.

5 MS. WEBER: Barbara Weber with Health Action  
6 New Mexico. We're a consumer -- health consumer  
7 advocacy group. And I think this is not an easy  
8 decision that you have before you. But if you look  
9 at the not fluoridating for children, particularly,  
10 Calgary a year before Albuquerque eliminated  
11 fluoridation, stopped fluoridating and -- but three  
12 years afterwards, their city did a comparison study  
13 to see what had happened in the children, and there  
14 was a significant increase in tooth decay among the  
15 children of Calgary.

16 So we have to think what it means for our  
17 children to not have this one tool we have for  
18 public health. I'd like to say we can all get the  
19 best dental care for all of our children, but that  
20 doesn't happen. We're working on it and we want to  
21 see it happen. But the public tool that we do have  
22 is fluoridation.

23 And every month new studies come out  
24 linking oral health to our overall health. But for  
25 children, we want to give them that right start,

1 and if it's been linked to diabetes, been linked to  
2 obesity, it's been linked to -- most recently, two  
3 months ago it came out that it was linked to  
4 cancer. So we have to assure the oral health of  
5 our population, but particularly our children.

6 Children of communities of color, low  
7 income children, particularly Native American  
8 children, carry the brunt of oral health disease,  
9 and we need to give them the right start. Thank  
10 you.

11 MR. CARROLL: Hi. My name is Lynn Carroll  
12 and I'm representing the State department of  
13 health. Our mission is to promote health and  
14 wellness and improved health outcomes for all  
15 people in New Mexico. Currently, I am the public  
16 health director, and as a member of the management  
17 team, it's my responsibility to ensure that our  
18 staff and programs improve the health status of New  
19 Mexicans.

20 I'm here to speak on behalf of the  
21 department and the state in support of the board  
22 funding water fluoridation. I've been working in  
23 public health for the past 28 years. I've worked  
24 for the U.S. Centers for Disease Control for  
25 27 years. At CDC at various times, I worked with

1 partners at all levels of government in city,  
2 county, state, federal and international. For the  
3 past year, I've worked with the New Mexico  
4 Department of Health.

5           Throughout my career, I've been involved  
6 in establishing and promoting various health  
7 programs and initiatives to improve the health and  
8 well-being of communities. CDC has declared that  
9 community water fluoridation is one of the ten  
10 great public health accomplishments of the last  
11 century.

12           So I can assure you that community water  
13 fluoridation is safe and effective, and it's an  
14 effective way of preventing dental disease.  
15 Community water fluoridation is safe. With the  
16 exception of immunization. The community water  
17 fluoridation has been studied more than any other  
18 public health intervention.

19           The scientific community has not found a  
20 relationship with disease or illness due to  
21 consuming fluoridated water, no diabetes, no  
22 malformation, no cognitive issues, no heart  
23 disease, in fact, no physical behavioral issues of  
24 any type. And community water fluoridation is  
25 effective.



1 CDC tells us that drinking fluoridated  
2 water keeps teeth strong and reduces cavities by  
3 205 percent in children and adults. As you may  
4 recall several decades -- for several decades the  
5 Albuquerque community received fluoridated water  
6 and there were no reports of poor health. These  
7 are the facts about community water fluoridation.

8 To really understand the issue, you  
9 should understand a couple of other things. First  
10 is rotten teeth. You can call them dental care --

11 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: Sir, thank you. That was  
12 the two minutes. Sorry.

13 Steven Quezada, followed by --

14 COMMISSIONER HART STEBBINS: Madam Chair,  
15 may I just request that he be allowed an extra  
16 minute, please? I'd like to hear what he has to  
17 say.

18 MR. CARROLL: So what I want you to  
19 remember, if you remember nothing else that I've  
20 said, is the community water fluoridation is not  
21 dangerous; rotten teeth are.

22 Rotten teeth have been associated with  
23 cardiovascular disease, stroke and low birth rate.  
24 So water fluoridation is not dangerous, but not  
25 taking care of yourself, your teeth. And water

1 fluoridation is one of the best ways to do that. I  
2 think you should -- I think you should add fluoride  
3 back to your water.

4 MR. MANZANARES: Well, good evening  
5 everybody. Thank you guys for having me. I  
6 appreciate you guys having us down this evening to  
7 discuss this very important issue.

8 My name is Michael Manzanares, and I'm an  
9 Albuquerque resident. I'm a public health dentist  
10 here in the metroplex. I work for Presbyterian  
11 medical service.

12 You know, I'm here to strongly encourage  
13 you guys to supplement the water with fluoride.  
14 Every day I see people who fluoride would strongly,  
15 strongly benefit.

16 You know, there's nothing worse than when  
17 you see a young child in your dental chair who has  
18 a toothache. It's the absolute worst thing. You  
19 know, this week alone, I saw a 12-year-old who has  
20 a first molar which is the tooth that comes in at  
21 six years old that needed to be extracted.

22 Fluoride is something that can help these children.

23 At an early age, when children are having  
24 a hard time learning how to brush their teeth and  
25 whatnot, a natural -- you know, having the water --

1   having fluoride added to their water source can  
2   really, really help them.

3               You know, you're going to hear a lot of  
4   research this evening. But the one thing that, you  
5   know, you're not going to hear is there is no  
6   scientifically valid evidence that backs up  
7   fluoride causes cancer and kidney disease or any  
8   other disorder. For that matter, the World Health  
9   Organization, the American Dental Association, the  
10   American Medical Association, the Indian Health  
11   Service, the American Cancer Society and the  
12   American Pharmaceutical Association all endorse  
13   fluoride.

14              We all have an opportunity here this  
15   evening to really do the right thing and help the  
16   masses of our people. Everything here is backed by  
17   science. So I really thank you for this  
18   opportunity and I strongly, strongly encourage you  
19   folks to vote on behalf of water fluoridation.  
20   Thank you.

21              MS. CARREON: Steven Quezada, followed by  
22   Cherish [sic] Quezada.

23              COMMISSIONER QUEZADA: Madam Chair, Members  
24   of the Board, thank you. Look, I know that you  
25   always have a lot of big decisions to make,

1 especially here at the water -- how water is used,  
2 who uses the water, how they use the water. But  
3 what we're talking about, putting something in the  
4 water, this is effecting everybody, from unborn  
5 children all the way to our elderly.

6 And for you to make that, it concerns me  
7 a little bit to not know or not to think that  
8 everybody functions differently, that all of us  
9 function differently, that we're not the exact  
10 same. To know that all of us have a different  
11 fingerprints will show you that the billion of  
12 people on this planet and everybody has a different  
13 fingerprint should tell you that we're all  
14 different and that our bodies react to different  
15 things differently.

16 And to force this on us as a way of  
17 saying that this is good for the community as a  
18 whole, we could also argue the fact that the best  
19 way to address our behavioral health problem is to  
20 put Prozac in the water, whether they want it or  
21 not.

22 I don't believe that this is something  
23 that you should really make a decision on. And,  
24 again, I appreciate all the decisions that you make  
25 on a daily basis. My plea this afternoon or this

1 evening is to -- to say I think that you should put  
2 it to the voters. And you should take it out of  
3 the power of this board. And we have a big  
4 election coming up really soon; it's a really large  
5 election. And you will have a large turnout, and  
6 you let the community that this is going to affect  
7 come out and whether make the decision as a  
8 community and not as a board. Thank you.

9 MS. CARREON: Cherish Quezada, followed by  
10 Shelly Fritz.

11 MS. QUEZADA: Good morning, Madam Chair and  
12 Board Members. My name is Cherise Quezada. I'm an  
13 Albuquerque resident. I'm also the president of  
14 the Route 66 West Neighborhood Association and the  
15 secretary of the Southwest Alliance of Neighbors,  
16 also known as SWAN.

17 I'm here this evening to represent my  
18 opinions and not those of the organizations I  
19 serve. I have a profound fear of public speaking  
20 and am not one to easily sign up for public comment  
21 unless it's something I'm deeply passionate about.

22 I suffer from an autoimmune disease  
23 called Hashimoto thyroiditis. This disease affects  
24 many thousands of people. It's a condition that  
25 causes my immune system to produce antibodies that

1 damages and suppresses my thyroid gland.

2 My belief is that ingesting water  
3 supplemented with fluoride further suppresses my  
4 thyroid function. I don't know the amount of  
5 fluoride I'm ingesting on a daily basis because  
6 it's an uncontrolled dosage, since it's in many  
7 things we consume, not just the water. I also  
8 believe that water fluoridation is a form of mass  
9 medication without informed consent.

10 I'm strongly opposed to funding an  
11 increase of fluoride levels in the municipal water  
12 supply, and I implore you to take this issue to the  
13 voters. Thank you.

14 MS. CARREON: Shelly Fritz, followed by  
15 David Manzanares.

16 MS. FRITZ: My name is Shelly Fritz. I'm a  
17 dentist in Albuquerque and I have been in dentistry  
18 as a dental assistant, a dental hygienist and as a  
19 dentist for 45 years.

20 And I see mouth after mouth that looks  
21 great. And you know why? It's because we have  
22 fluoride in our water. We're talking about at the  
23 time when we did have fluoride in the water we were  
24 talking about 1.2 parts per million. That is one  
25 one-fiftieth of a grain of salt in 1 liter of

1 water. That's all we need. We need less than that  
2 now because we know we get fluoride from our food.  
3 And that's why the water authority originally  
4 took -- quit adding fluoride.

5           You know, 75 percent of the U.S.  
6 population has fluoride in their water system. And  
7 if you've compared that to water systems that don't  
8 have fluoride and the people that ingest that water  
9 that doesn't have fluoride, we have saved  
10 \$40 billion in health care costs. How much do you  
11 think we're saving here?

12           These great employees that were here that  
13 were -- that had provided special services beyond  
14 their jobs, I would personally give one of these  
15 employees \$1,000 to -- to not have put the fluoride  
16 in if they had not taken it out when they did,  
17 because we don't have it now, we still have about  
18 4 parts per million right now. But to get it up to  
19 the optimum amount, we're adding 3.3 parts per  
20 million to get it up to where it was before we took  
21 it out.

22           So I beseech you to do this. It is a  
23 wonderful public health initiative, and we had it  
24 for 40 -- over 40 years, and we need to get it  
25 back. Thank you.

1 MS. CARREON: David Manzanares, followed by  
2 Glen Cumyford.

3 MR. MANZANAARES: Madam Chair, Members of  
4 the Committee, good evening and thank you for  
5 having us here this evening. I'm Dr. David  
6 Manzanares. I'm the secretary/treasurer of the New  
7 Mexico Dental Association, and I'm a fellow of the  
8 academy of gentle dentistry. And I'm here to  
9 encourage you to add, reinstate the optimization of  
10 our fluoride levels at .7 percent -- I'm sorry --  
11 .7 parts per million.

12 This is a critical human health measure.  
13 It is -- we are the second largest community in the  
14 country that does not have water fluoridation. And  
15 when you look at the toll that this is taking on  
16 our public health systems, the number of people who  
17 are affected and who do not have access to care,  
18 it -- this is worsened by leaving the fluoride out.

19 This is one of the most simple,  
20 straightforward, economic ways to encourage  
21 preventive medicine. Every doctor will tell you  
22 that an ounce of prevention is worth a pound of  
23 cure. And it will save your communities and our  
24 health care systems in the long run if we work on  
25 doing this very simple straightforward preventative



1 measure.

2 Commissioner Quezada brought up a very  
3 good point. He said this issue should go before  
4 the public for a vote. Well, it did. And the  
5 public overwhelmingly supported it. Fluoride was  
6 removed from the water without the consent of the  
7 people. And are we going to keep deferring issues  
8 to the public if we don't agree with what the vote  
9 says. The people have spoken. They said they want  
10 a preventive measure in here to help reduce the  
11 amount of dental caries in our community. This is  
12 a great way to move forward. This is the most  
13 responsible thing to do. Thank you.

14 MS. CARREON: Glen Cumyford, followed by  
15 Christopher Oglesby.

16 MR. CUMYFORD: Okay. As you may guess, I'm  
17 here to speak in opposition of this. Yeah, we did  
18 vote on water fluoridation. That happened to be in  
19 1970. I think we were knee deep in the war of  
20 Vietnam, and somebody like Nixon was president.  
21 You know, that's been a long time ago.

22 And I just want to talk about what this  
23 stuff really is you're adding to our drinking  
24 water. The fluoride you're going to be adding is  
25 not of pharmaceutical grade. Right off of the

1 water authority website, the fluoride to be added  
2 will be hydrofluorosilicic acid. And I'd just like  
3 to read a little story about where this stuff comes  
4 from.

5 Fluosilicic acid is a unpurified  
6 industrial byproduct that are collected in wet  
7 scrubber chimney pollution control devices. These  
8 devices are now required by law to capture  
9 contaminants such as silicofluoride, lead, arsenic  
10 and mercury from being emitted during such things  
11 as phosphate fertilizer production, aluminum  
12 production and uranium production.

13 This water based wet scrubber  
14 hydrofluorosilicic acid containing contaminants is  
15 then taken out of the chimneys and stored in  
16 overnight cooling lakes, further exposed to  
17 airborne contaminants.

18 The industry produce millions of gallons  
19 of this liquid hazardous waste. It costs thousands  
20 of dollars per ton to properly neutralize and  
21 dispose of hydrofluorosilicic acid.

22 Hydrofluorosilicic acid is then drawn  
23 from open air cooling ponds. It is containerized  
24 and it is shipped to your municipal water  
25 authorities. Hydrofluorosilicic acid remains

1 contaminated with various traces of lead, arsenic,  
2 mercury and radioactive materials. It is delivered  
3 unrefined and is not pharmaceutical grade to be  
4 used as a water fluoridation product.

5 And as Dr. J. William Hirzy, senior  
6 chemist at the USEPA headquarters, states: If this  
7 stuff, hydrofluorosilicic acid, gets into the air,  
8 it is a pollutant; if it gets into the river, it is  
9 a pollutant; if it gets into a lake, it is a  
10 pollutant. But if it goes straight into your  
11 drinking water, it's not. I find that amazing.

12 And I just want to know how anybody on  
13 this water board could consider taking stuff that  
14 is hazardous waste and putting it in our drinking  
15 water. No matter what you say, it's not good.

16 MS. CARREON: Christopher Oglesby, followed  
17 by Rudy Biel [sic].

18 MR. OGLESBY: My name is Christopher  
19 Oglesby, and I oppose the medication of my water.  
20 I understand that fluoride, as topically applied to  
21 the teeth, will prevent cavities; ingested, will  
22 not. But oral health, and I'm hearing a lot of  
23 health people can maybe tell me is a personal  
24 responsibility. What about flossing and what about  
25 diet and my personal health. There's a lot more to

1 it than just letting everyone know do what you  
2 want, we're going to put medicine in the water like  
3 a magic bullet.

4 My mom, who is an elderly woman, is  
5 calcium deficient, osteoporosis, she's Vitamin D  
6 deficient. I'm not asking you guys to drink  
7 Vitamin D or calcium. That's her responsibility to  
8 get what she needs to supplement.

9 For her, as well, she was told to take  
10 Warfarin as a blood thinner. It didn't work for  
11 her. It didn't work for her, but it works for  
12 others. It's been said that we have the personal  
13 responsibility to take care of our own health. I  
14 have children and I'm here to speak against the  
15 medication of the water that I pay for in an  
16 ever-increasing bill.

17 And I just want to ask again that you  
18 consider not adding -- oh, then my final point is  
19 this. When the water -- when we switched to the  
20 surface water, we were told there was so many  
21 parts, or .7 parts per million, and then we get a  
22 drought and we go back to the aquifer. Who is  
23 monitoring the difference between the our water in  
24 the aquifer and the water that's coming from the  
25 surface? The CDC has changed their number from 9

1 to 74. What's this magic number.

2 I'm asking you not to medicate my water.

3 Let me take the personal responsibility for my own  
4 health. Thank you.

5 MS. CARREON: Rudy Biel, followed by Jerry  
6 Worrall.

7 MR. BLEA: Good afternoon, again. My name  
8 is Rudy Blea. I am the program director with the  
9 State of New Mexico. Thank you again for giving me  
10 the opportunity to address this group of -- body.

11 For the last two years you have heard and  
12 read about the efficacy of water fluoridation. We  
13 have provided you with scientific literature  
14 supporting the effectiveness and reducing the  
15 incidence of tooth decay among all populations.

16 The supporting science outweighs the  
17 findings of our opponents. As you have already  
18 heard, for several decades your community has  
19 consumed regulated fluoridated water and there has  
20 been no health effects been reported in the past  
21 20, 30 years. For over 50 years, the City of Santa  
22 Fe has fluoridated its system. Again, there have  
23 been no health effects been reported by the  
24 citizens of Santa Fe.

25 The local community supports your vote in

1 favor of community water fluoridation. You have  
2 received numerous letters and e-mails from local  
3 citizens and representatives from state and  
4 national organizations who are encouraging your  
5 vote, your favorable vote.

6 I would like to especially draw attention  
7 to some of the letters you have received from three  
8 companies here in the City of Albuquerque: Mira,  
9 Incorporated; New Mexico Smiles, and Participa,  
10 Inc. These three organizations provide APS  
11 students dental health care. Each of the three  
12 CEOs of these organizations have reported to you  
13 the incidents -- the high rate of incidents of  
14 tooth decay that they have found in APS.

15 With water fluoridation, along with  
16 teaching the kids how to eat healthy, brush, floss  
17 and seeing a dentist twice a year, we can reduce  
18 the incidence of tooth decay among the people,  
19 especially the kids and elementary and high school  
20 students of the Albuquerque Public Schools system.

21 Once again, I ask for your favorable vote  
22 for water community fluoridation, reminding you no  
23 health effects have been reported. Thank you.

24 MS. CARREON: Jerry Worrall, followed by Roy  
25 Life.

1           MR. WORRALL: Good evening. I'm Jerry  
2   Worrall, president of the West Side Coalition of  
3   Neighborhood Associations.

4           At our regularly scheduled meeting, we  
5   brought this issue up, and of our 25 members, of  
6   which a quorum was present, we only had one  
7   dissenting vote. We ask you to raise the  
8   fluoridation level to the federal standard. It was  
9   quite a discussion. For those of you who have been  
10   to Westside Coalition meetings, you know that we  
11   can get into those discussions.

12           But at this point, I want to take my  
13   coalition hat off and speak to you as a person who  
14   had the unique experience of not being a poor kid,  
15   but getting to grow up in a poor neighborhood and  
16   seeing the decisions that were made.

17           There was never a period in my life over  
18   my lifetime that I didn't -- I wasn't in a  
19   dentist's office every six months. I cannot say  
20   that about my friends that I grew up with, and I  
21   cannot say it about the young children in that  
22   neighborhood.

23           But one of the things that I found in my  
24   55 years of volunteering my time for the betterment  
25   of the community: Very rarely, by holding up my

1 hand, have I been able to dramatically effect the  
2 health of -- the teeth health of young children or  
3 on any issue.

4 And this is your opportunity individually  
5 to say I'm going to do what I believe is right for  
6 the children of the community who cannot help  
7 themselves. That's what I'm asking you to do.  
8 Please approve this.

9 MS. CARREON: Roy Life, followed by Leah  
10 Nelson.

11 MR. LIFE: Hello. My name is Roy. Thank  
12 you for allowing me to speak. I stand with  
13 everyone that's here opposing fluoride in the  
14 water. It is -- I have done plenty of fluoride  
15 treatments in the past. After discovering the fact  
16 that -- how toxic fluoride is, I've now chose not  
17 to put fluoride on my teeth or use fluoride  
18 toothpaste.

19 It's amazing to me that fluoride is  
20 basically a known toxin, but yet -- and it  
21 specifies it on toothpaste, that if you even  
22 consume a small pea-size amount, that to call  
23 poison control. But yet, people's arguments are  
24 that if you consume it in small amounts, that it's  
25 okay.



1           I believe that it's mass -- it's mass  
2   medicating everybody, and I oppose mass medication  
3   of an element that's also known as a neurotoxin.

4           I know everybody is concerned about kids'  
5   teeth. I have a son, I'm concerned about his  
6   teeth, but as a parent I -- you know, I support  
7   just good hygiene and basically teaching him  
8   everything I can about, you know, protecting his  
9   teeth by other means and not using fluoride.

10           So I oppose it and I'm glad I'm allowed  
11   to speak, so thank you.

12           MS. CARREON: Leah Nelson, followed by  
13   Andrew Nelson.

14           MS. NELSON: Good evening. My name is  
15   Dr. Leah Nelson. I'm a resident physician of  
16   preventive medicine, as well as a mother of a small  
17   child. I'm a resident here of Albuquerque and we  
18   are customers of the Albuquerque Water Authority.  
19   I also have a master's degree in environmental  
20   engineering.

21           I'm here to encourage the board to  
22   support, approve -- or approve funding for water  
23   fluoridation. For many years Albuquerque residents  
24   consumed water fluoridation without any harmful  
25   effects being noted.

1           Both the American Medical Association and  
2   the American Pediatric Association, as well as  
3   New Mexico affiliates, support water fluoridation.

4           As many have said, it has been shown to  
5   reduce the incidents of dental caries. When it is  
6   ingested by a child, it lasts for up 40 to 50 years  
7   of reducing the amount of dental caries they have  
8   and then all of the heart disease and other sequela  
9   that come with bad dental health.

10          An argument that I haven't heard anyone  
11   bring up is actually that fluoridation will save  
12   Albuquerque and the State of New Mexico significant  
13   amounts of money. Per person, per year,  
14   fluoridation might cost somewhere between 50 cents  
15   and \$2.50 per year. However, other states that  
16   have studied fluoridation on their water, have seen  
17   a \$24-per-person decrease in Medicaid costs  
18   associated with dental expenses. And that can be  
19   directly attributed, in large part, to fluoridation  
20   of the water.

21          Finally, fluoridation is very safe. Of  
22   the more than 3,000 scientific studies published  
23   about fluoridation that show it is safe, the  
24   anti-fluoride activists do not have the backing of  
25   scientific literature.

1           Of course anything consumed in huge  
2 amounts is toxic. The chlorine that we use to kill  
3 the bacteria is toxic, and we don't see us taking  
4 chlorine out of our water.

5           So in conclusion, please vote in favor of  
6 fluoridation of our water supply. It's safe,  
7 effective, and it has potential to save the State  
8 of New Mexico huge amounts of money in the long  
9 term. Thank you.

10           MS. CARREON: Andrew Nelson, followed by  
11 Christine Nathe.

12           MR. NELSON: Sorry. We're have a child  
13 meltdown. That's exactly why this is so important  
14 we're here.

15           So I've been trying to think of a good  
16 example for fluoride. And here in New Mexico, we  
17 love green chile. So fluoride is a lot like green  
18 chile, where a life without green chile is  
19 terrible. But when you get too much fluoride,  
20 there's some pretty dire consequences.

21           So the same is true with fluoride, where  
22 if you have no fluoride in your diet, it's really  
23 bad for your teeth, you get cavities. But if you  
24 have very high levels, it is true that it is toxic.  
25 And I actually make a living as a toxicologist, and

1 my background, I have a Ph.D. in toxicology and a  
2 master's in public health.

3 And we see this with every single  
4 environmental contaminant; that if you look in the  
5 scientific literature, on one side you see that it  
6 can cause harm, and on the other side, that it's  
7 protective. And you're always going to find this  
8 with every single contaminant you look at.

9 So it's not any one paper, like The  
10 Lancet paper, where you heard about that you should  
11 look at. You should look at the collective body of  
12 literature. And all of the body of literature  
13 about fluoride suggests that a level of about 1.5  
14 milligrams per liter is protective and actually is  
15 extremely important for preventing cavities. And  
16 if you go below that, you start to lose that  
17 protective factor.

18 You see the same thing with alcohol,  
19 where if you have very small amounts of alcohol,  
20 it's good for your -- potentially for your  
21 longevity, but if you have a fifth of vodka,  
22 obviously that's very bad. So, you know, this is  
23 true of a lot of things, a lot of toxins and toxic  
24 chemicals in small doses that are actually  
25 beneficial.

1           So right now, I did a survey of the water  
2   levels in Albuquerque. I looked at the publicly  
3   available data. And the average level in  
4   Albuquerque is about .5 milligrams per liter, parts  
5   per million. And all of the collective mass of  
6   literature from the scientific community suggests  
7   that 1.5, again, is the level we're targeting for.  
8   So we're about a third of what we should be  
9   targeting for.

10           So thank you for your time. Appreciate  
11   it.

12           MS. CARREON: Christine Nathe, followed by  
13   Robert Manzanares.

14           MS. NATHE: Hi. My name is Christine Nathe.  
15   I've been a registered dental hygienist for over 30  
16   years. And in those years and continuing to this  
17   day, I see the devastating effects of poor oral  
18   health and cavities in children. And when you see  
19   it day after day, it's very difficult.

20           I'm also the program director of the  
21   dental hygiene program at the University of New  
22   Mexico, and I author textbooks in dental public  
23   health and in primary preventive dentistry.

24           So I strongly believe the evidence is  
25   there that shows that the science definitely

1 promote the use of fluoride and community water  
2 fluoridation.

3 And, you know, with the public health  
4 perspective, the best thing that we can do is  
5 ensure preventive measures for everybody, and  
6 fluoride does that. It is the only thing that we  
7 have right now that doesn't create oral health  
8 disparities. And we all know that health  
9 disparities is an issue in our state. And we have  
10 this one mechanism to help alleviate that that we  
11 used to have, and I hope that you'll take that into  
12 consideration. And thank you.

13 MS. CARREON: Robert Manzanares, followed by  
14 Joe Martinez.

15 MR. MANZANARES: Madam Chair, Members of the  
16 Board, thank you for the opportunity that you're  
17 giving us to express our perspective on this issue.  
18 My name is Robert Manzanares. I'm a recently  
19 retired dentist of about 37 years, practicing in  
20 northern New Mexico. Now I live here in  
21 Albuquerque.

22 Now, I had the honor to address you  
23 last -- this past June regarding this same issue.  
24 But I felt so compelled that this is such an  
25 important thing that I wanted to come here and see

1 if I could kind of come up with a little bit  
2 different thought on what's going on here.

3           You know, my concern is that more dental  
4 decay is going to result in more pain and  
5 suffering, more missed work, more missed school,  
6 which results in more lost revenue, greater  
7 expenditures for businesses for government, for the  
8 individual. The lost learning time that our  
9 children might suffer might be the greatest impact  
10 that we have moving into the future.

11           And you've already heard the facts.  
12 You're aware of the endorsements of the world's  
13 most credible organizations supporting the use of  
14 properly regulated fluoride, properly regulated  
15 fluoride concentrations in the water. You're aware  
16 that sound science has been used to make these  
17 decisions, these determinations. You're aware that  
18 most major communities across America provide  
19 optimally fluoridated drinking water to their  
20 residents. You're aware of the considerable oral  
21 health cost savings related to using fluoride.

22           Now, perhaps discussions have been too  
23 scientific or too political, so maybe we need to  
24 look at some of these obstacles on the road to oral  
25 health; specifically, pain and toothaches. Have

1    you ever had a toothache? Has your child ever had  
2    a tooth acre? Your mom, your dad, your brother,  
3    your sister, your neighbor? If you've ever had  
4    that, you can relate to what pain is. It's amazing  
5    how something so small can cause such great pain.  
6    It can become the center of your universe.

7               Over my career, I saw many, many patients  
8    with toothaches. The pain most frequently that was  
9    related to severe decay, where there was carious  
10   exposure of the pulp, that means decay into the  
11   nerve; where there's a fractured tooth, an infected  
12   tooth or otherwise. The pain is often severe, it  
13   is horrible.

14              The worst cases were in little children,  
15   little guys. It was miserable to have them come  
16   in. You had to gain control of management. You  
17   had to take care of their emergency. And the  
18   problem was, is that there's a mouthful of other  
19   emergencies waiting to happen unless we could get  
20   to those things quickly.

21              Fluoride is something that's good for us  
22   here. It's not a magic bullet if it's used alone.  
23   It will not stop dental emergencies from happening.  
24   But if used in the algorithm for dental health, it  
25   is extremely valuable and critical in its



1 importance, a reasonable diet, good oral hygiene  
2 habits, regular dental checkups and fluoride are  
3 all equal in importance.

4 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: Thank you.

5 MR. MANZANARES: Please do the right thing.  
6 Please vote favorably for this. Thank you.

7 MS. CARREON: Joe Martinez, followed by  
8 Robert Schiller.

9 MR. MARTINEZ: Thank you, Members of the  
10 Water Authority Board. My name is Joe Martinez.  
11 I'm a resident of Albuquerque and Bernalillo for  
12 the last 31 wonderful years.

13 I believe this may not be a matter for  
14 the professionals or for the alarmists to tell you  
15 what to do. I do want to let you know that more  
16 important, is it for you to take responsibility to  
17 do the right thing for the tens of thousands of  
18 children who will benefit from restarting community  
19 water fluoridation.

20 Please note, this community, countywide,  
21 is one of the few, few communities across the  
22 country that does not do community water  
23 fluoridation today. Tonight, make it a matter  
24 between you, as a decision maker, and many, many  
25 children that your decision will be to make it

1 possible for children to have this cavity  
2 prevention measure. And certainly, this is -- this  
3 impacts all residents, the seniors, families,  
4 persons with disabilities and it's serving the  
5 children.

6 And to back you up, solid research, solid  
7 safety practices, and the very capable water staff  
8 that will be very willing and very ready to  
9 implement this practice.

10 Thank you. Please do the right thing.

11 MS. CARREON: Robert Schiller, followed by  
12 Mariela Leyba.

13 MR. SCHILLER: Thank you. My name is Robert  
14 Schiller. And because of health concerns, I have  
15 been reading nonfiction for over 40 years. Here's  
16 something from a book called "Make an Informed  
17 Vaccine Decision" that I'd like to read to you,  
18 because many of you use the CDC as a basis for the  
19 fluoridation.

20 Tom Verstraeten, a CDC epidemiologist,  
21 had analyzed the agencies massive vaccine safety  
22 data link, database, containing millions of medical  
23 records of vaccinated children and confirmed a link  
24 between thimerosal, which is mercury, and childhood  
25 vaccines. Because of this, in July of 1999, health

1 officials recommended that vaccine manufactures  
2 eliminate thimerosal as a preservative as soon as  
3 possible.

4           However, newly released documents show  
5 that the CDC was simultaneously working behind the  
6 scenes to discourage thimerosal's removal.

7           In June 2000, a top-secret meeting of  
8 health officials and government scientists occurred  
9 at the secluded Simpsonwood Conference Center in  
10 Norcross, Georgia. Although the CDC convened the  
11 meeting, no public announcement was made of the  
12 gathering. Just 52 private invitations were  
13 issued, including CDC, FDA, WHO, and  
14 representatives and from every major vaccine  
15 manufacturer.

16           All of the participants were repeatedly  
17 warned that the scientific data -- they were warned  
18 by the CDC -- data under discussion was quote,  
19 embargoed, unquote. Note-taking and photographs of  
20 documents were strictly prohibited, no papers could  
21 leave the room. Dr. Robert Chen, head of vaccine  
22 safety for the CDC, congratulated the group for  
23 their apparent success, thus far, at concealing the  
24 contacts.

25           Yet instead of taking quick action to

1 warn parents and recall the unsafe shots, this  
2 audacious group of 52 vaccine proponents spent the  
3 next two days calculating how to conceal the truth.  
4 This is the CDC.

5 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: Thank you, sir.

6 MS. CARREON: Mariela Leyba, followed by  
7 Jeremiah Dye.

8 MS. LEYBA: Madam Chair, Members of the  
9 Board, thank you for allowing us to hear public  
10 comment tonight. My name is Mariela Leyba. I'm a  
11 lifelong resident of Albuquerque and a customer of  
12 the Albuquerque Bernalillo County Water Utility  
13 Authority. I'm the mother of a  
14 one-and-a-half-year-old son, who I simply adore. I  
15 want him to have all the best things in life, and  
16 one of those things is community water  
17 fluoridation.

18 I was fortunate to grow up with access to  
19 fluoridated water and I want the same for my son.  
20 I'm also a dental hygienist and Region 6 dental  
21 hygiene Head Start liaison for the State of New  
22 Mexico. I see kids in Head Start and early Head  
23 Start, you know, so that ranges from zero to five  
24 years old, and many with active dental decay. It's  
25 a shame that that has to happen.

1           In past meetings, we've heard from those  
2   opposed to community water fluoridation who have  
3   provided a lot of different suggestions to remedy  
4   this through education and outreach. And I  
5   completely agree with those efforts to continue,  
6   you know, efforts to improve nutrition and oral  
7   hygiene habits. But tonight, we have the unique  
8   opportunity to have an immediate positive impact on  
9   all of the residents in our community.

10           So I please urge you to vote, use this  
11   opportunity to vote to reinstate community water  
12   fluoridation in Albuquerque. Thank you.

13           MS. CARREON: Jeremiah Dye, followed by  
14   Patrick Manzanares.

15           MR. DYE: Thank you for the chance to speak.  
16   I've been a resident of Albuquerque since 2009.  
17   And remember moving here being so proud to be part  
18   of a modern city that had chlorinated water so that  
19   I could confidently drink it and not be concerned  
20   about bacteria that could cause disease or  
21   infection. And I was also very proud that I had  
22   fluoridated water that would help protect me and my  
23   family from cavities.

24           I have five kids now, and it's very  
25   important to me that they -- we drink, in our

1 family, our city water supply, and we're very proud  
2 of our city water supply.

3 In 2011, I remember being really  
4 disappointed when I first received my water quality  
5 notice saying that we were no longer going to be  
6 actively managing the fluoride level in our water.  
7 But then I noticed that it was -- our current  
8 supply at that point was .7 parts per million,  
9 which is the CDC recommendation. So I said, "Well,  
10 they must have it all under control."

11 Since then, our concentration is down to  
12 .4 or .5 parts per million, which causes me a lot  
13 of concern. So I'm here to advocate that we begin  
14 reinstating addition of fluoride to our water  
15 supply up to CDC standards, and we continue to add  
16 chlorine also to our water so that it is safe for  
17 drinking. Thank you.

18 MS. CARREON: Patrick Manzanares, followed  
19 by Andrea Eicher.

20 MR. MANZANARES: Madam Chair, Fellow Board  
21 Members, thank you for letting us offer public  
22 comment on this very important issue.

23 My name is Patrick Manzanares, and I am  
24 receiving my master's in public health from the  
25 University of -- I mean, New Mexico State

1 University. Prior to that, I received my  
2 bachelor's in biochemistry.

3 Throughout my education, I've always been  
4 very interested and feel the importance of public  
5 health. For the last ten years, I've had the  
6 opportunity to work for organizations like the  
7 Presbyterian Medical Services and the state  
8 department's office of oral health.

9 At Presbyterian Medical Services, I  
10 assisted with the mobile dental van, where we  
11 provided dental services for individuals in  
12 fluoridated communities, such as Santa Fe and very  
13 remote communities that were without fluoridated  
14 water.

15 And consistently, we see over and over  
16 and over again, all the communities that didn't  
17 have fluoridated water had increased levels of  
18 dental decay. And the opposite was true, those  
19 with fluoridated water in Santa Fe County and so  
20 forth had a decreased level of dental decay.

21 As such, I think it is very obvious that  
22 this is an initiative that you should be passing,  
23 you should be supporting for the benefit of the  
24 public good.

25 Many of those individuals who experienced

1 dental decay were from poor, minority groups. This  
2 is a health inequality. And in order to prevent  
3 this health inequality from continuing, I do  
4 believe that water -- fluoridated water has to be  
5 returned to the water supply here in Albuquerque.  
6 Thank you.

7 MS. CARREON: Andrea Eicher, followed by  
8 Mary Rose Twohig.

9 MS. EICHER: Good evening. My name is  
10 Andrea Eicher. I'm a lifelong resident of  
11 Albuquerque. I have a toddler and I have another  
12 child on the way. I'm also a public health  
13 dentist, and I support community water  
14 fluoridation.

15 I don't have much to say that everyone  
16 else hasn't already spoken to, but I would like to  
17 make the point that the parents in this room, the  
18 mothers and fathers in this room, are probably  
19 going to find a way -- another way, to keep their  
20 children's oral health, and so they are probably  
21 going to be brushing their teeth and making sure  
22 that they get nutritious foods they need to prevent  
23 cavities.

24 But this doesn't necessarily represent  
25 the majority of children in Albuquerque and in



1 New Mexico. So this is their biggest defense  
2 against tooth decay. So I really recommend that we  
3 continue -- or that we supplement our water with  
4 the optimal fluoride. Thank you.

5 MS. CARREON: Mary Rose Twohig, followed by  
6 David Gangwish.

7 MS. TWOHIG: Hi. I'm Mary Rose Twohig. I'm  
8 the president of the Albuquerque District Dental  
9 Society. There are many good arguments for  
10 fluoridation, which you've already heard. Another  
11 thing I just wanted to present to you was a  
12 petition that has been signed by many residents of  
13 Albuquerque in support of water fluoridation. So  
14 we encourage you to supplement the water  
15 fluoridation in Albuquerque. Thank you.

16 MS. CARREON: David Gangwish, followed by  
17 Brian Bakyl.

18 MR. GANGWISH: Hello. Thank you for letting  
19 me speak. I'm David Gangwish. I'm a medical  
20 student here at the University of New Mexico, and  
21 I'm also a health economist.

22 I would like to -- all decisions are  
23 hard, and this one is not. And the main reason for  
24 that is you have to weigh the risks and the  
25 benefits. So if you address the risks that have

1    been presented to you to increase the CDC  
2    recommended fluorination of the water, a  
3    six-year-old weighing about 45 pounds would have to  
4    drink 2800 cups of water in a day to reach  
5    significantly toxic levels. And drinking a  
6    significantly less amount of that water would  
7    injure the child before that.

8                So I think that the risks are absolutely  
9    minimal and the health benefits are -- have been  
10   obviously stated by many professionals before me.

11               So the other economic argument, which  
12   have been previously stated, is fluorination in  
13   water has a return on investment somewhere between  
14   the 20 and \$50 per dollar, and that's definitely an  
15   investment I would make. Along with the added  
16   benefit of reducing tooth decay, which causes an  
17   enormous amount of suffering in the children and  
18   adults of the City of Albuquerque. Thank you.

19               MS. CARREON: Brian Bakyl, followed by Tom  
20   Schripsena.

21               MR. BAKYL: Hello. My name is Brian Bakyl,  
22   and I stand in front of you in favor of water  
23   fluoridation. We all like to feel special.  
24   Personally, nothing makes me feel more special than  
25   when I'm surrounded by dumb people. And nothing

1 makes more people dumber than forcing them to drink  
2 rat poison.

3 By comparison, people with high IQs feel  
4 immensely special. So much so, that without any  
5 training or understanding, we can practice medicine  
6 without a license. Heck, with not even having a  
7 mail order diploma, we can treat medical conditions  
8 like cavities by wantonly distributing drugs in our  
9 water supply with no regard to effect dosage or  
10 sensitivities of our patients. How freaking cool  
11 is that? And we don't even need the Kool-Aid aid  
12 to get them to drink it. Though a jet fuel chaser  
13 from the local groundwater complements it nicely.

14 Speaking of medicine, fluoride is a seed  
15 that will grow a fruitful bouquet of health  
16 conditions: Dementia, diabetes, muscle  
17 deterioration, rotting bones and teeth, which is  
18 known as fluorosis. It's also very hard on your  
19 liver and kidneys. But wait, that's not all. If  
20 you act now, you get cancer. That's right, cancer.

21 The Taylor Study at the University of  
22 Texas show that water fluoridation at a level of  
23 1 part per million increases tumor growth by  
24 25 percent. Quote, in point of fact, fluoride  
25 causes more human cancer deaths and causes it

1 faster than any other chemical.

2 That's a quote by Dr. Dean Burk, who is  
3 not only a 30-year veteran, but cofounder of the  
4 U.S. National Cancer Institute. He went on to  
5 equate water fluoridation with, quote, public  
6 murder, unquote.

7 It should be noted that fluoride  
8 consumption has never been approved by the FDA as  
9 being either safe or effective. And though I'm not  
10 saying this is why it's done, the added benefit or  
11 the icing on the cake, is that this effects  
12 Hispanics and blacks vastly more than whites. On  
13 average, 180 percent increase.

14 For example, while blacks make up  
15 15 percent of the population, they account for over  
16 20 percent of all kidney failure patients. Based  
17 on these encouraging studies, I fully recommend  
18 water fluoridation and want to thank you for  
19 keeping my teeth and Albuquerque white.

20 MS. CARREON: Tom Schripsena, followed by  
21 Joe Valles.

22 MR. SCHRIPSNA: Madam Chair and Members of  
23 the Board, thank you for allowing us to testify  
24 tonight.

25 I'm Tom Schripsena. I'm the executive

1 director of the New Mexico Dental Association and a  
2 dentist.

3           If you're like me, you've been watching  
4 all the things going on in Washington all summer  
5 long, the debates going on about what kind of  
6 health care plan we're going to have or what's  
7 going to happen with that. And if you're like me,  
8 you're probably getting pretty frustrated by the  
9 fact that we don't seem to be getting everywhere.  
10 Everybody recognizes that there's some kind of a  
11 problem, everybody agrees that health care is a  
12 right, something that people should have, but we  
13 can't seem to get together on it.

14           And the problem is that we don't know how  
15 to pay for it. That's really the bottom line.  
16 Everybody has one way of paying for it, but nobody  
17 can get everyone to agree on it.

18           You have the opportunity tonight to  
19 strike a blow in that discussion and in that  
20 battle, and that is because preventing disease is  
21 the best way to solve our health care crisis that  
22 we have. We're probably never going to be able to  
23 afford all of the kinds of treatments that  
24 everybody ought to have. But if people need fewer  
25 treatments, we may possibly get this under control.

1 And I think you have that opportunity to actually  
2 do something about that that for our citizens here.

3 Fluoride is not a medicine. I can show  
4 you all kind of medicine that contains fluoride  
5 where we actually use it as a medicine. But what  
6 we're talking about is optimal fluoridation of the  
7 water. Optimizing our water is what you do every  
8 single month when you meet here. You're making  
9 decisions about how to optimize the water in  
10 Albuquerque.

11 And we ask you to -- you know, I'll be  
12 the first to admit that I'm not an expert on water  
13 fluoridation. I know a lot about dental disease,  
14 but not that much about water fluoridation. But I  
15 listen to the experts. That's how we know how to  
16 do that. And I assume that you're not experts as  
17 well, but I hope you will listen to the experts at  
18 the CDHC, the World Health Organization, and all of  
19 the others who all agree on the same thing:  
20 Fluoride is safe and effective in preventing  
21 disease.

22 Thanks.

23 MS. CARREON: Joe Valles, followed by Ron  
24 Romero.

25 MR. VALLES: Thank you, Madam Chair and

1 board. As some of you know, I wear different hats.  
2 And I just want to tell you that we submitted  
3 through various neighborhood associations this  
4 motion: The Westside Coalition supports setting  
5 the maximum allowable fluoridation level at the  
6 optimum safe and effective standard of .7 parts per  
7 million as set by the center for disease control.

8 My neighborhood association supported it.  
9 As an executive member of WESCONA, Westside  
10 Coalition support it. As a member of the  
11 inter-coalition panel, they unanimously support it.  
12 As a practice dentist for more than 37 years at the  
13 same location, I support fluoridation. I've  
14 treated people from all walks of life, and in that  
15 time, I've not had one patient or chart indicate to  
16 me any health issues related to fluoridated water.  
17 And that would include 30 of the 40-year span when  
18 Albuquerque fluoridated its water supply.

19 As president of the New Mexico Dental  
20 Association, I want to express our sustained and  
21 unreserved support for supplemental fluoridation as  
22 recommended by the center for disease control.

23 At some point, we have to trust those  
24 public institutions and professionals charged with  
25 evaluating all evidence-based analysis and reports.

1 We trust that the water authority accepts the  
2 safety standard for arsenic and chlorine in our  
3 water. We should do the same for fluoride. And  
4 you heard from a professional a while ago, a  
5 toxicologist; he said we're only one-third of the  
6 way there.

7 My opinion is that the biggest bang for  
8 the buck is prevention, and fluoridation plays a  
9 major part. If you do not place emphasis on  
10 prevention and maintenance, the pending subsidy  
11 cost to the public will be substantial. I urge  
12 you, in the strongest terms, to support  
13 fluoridation. Thank you.

14 MS. CARREON: Ron Romero, followed by  
15 Katherine Sovereign.

16 MR. ROMERO: My name is Ron Romero. I've  
17 been a dentist practicing in public health settings  
18 for the last 40 years. I have probably seen more  
19 children in the State of New Mexico, including  
20 Albuquerque and Bernalillo, than most dentists in  
21 their years of practice.

22 The reason being is because I have gone  
23 to most every elementary school in New Mexico, and  
24 that includes preschool services such as Head  
25 Start, as well, and I have seen many mouths and



1 many teeth. And we have a thing called early  
2 childhood caries, which effects young children.  
3 And that's an epidemic at this point.

4 I see a lot of that, especially in the  
5 young kids. Kids without fluoridated water are  
6 more susceptible to that. So I urge you to do the  
7 right thing and support community water  
8 fluoridation.

9 The economic benefit to families in  
10 Albuquerque will be the best thing that you can do  
11 as a board to support community water fluoridation.  
12 It will be the best thing for your children.

13 And I also want to say that we're not  
14 living in a vacuum. Albuquerque is part of a state  
15 and we're part of a country. And there are other  
16 cities and other states that fluoridate their water  
17 as well. So we're not the only ones here.

18 There's cities like New York,  
19 Los Angeles, Chicago, Philadelphia, Phoenix,  
20 San Antonio, San Diego, Dallas, Jacksonville,  
21 Florida, which has naturally occurring fluoride in  
22 the water, and they're not taking it out.  
23 Indianapolis, San Francisco, Austin, Columbus, Fort  
24 Worth, Texas, Charlotte, North Carolina, Detroit.  
25 El Paso also has naturally occurring fluoridated

1 water in their system. And the list goes on.

2 But Albuquerque will be among those --  
3 one of the largest cities that is not fluoridated  
4 if we don't do the right thing. So I urge you to  
5 do that. Thank you.

6 MS. CARREON: Katherine Sovereign, followed  
7 by Elaine Hebbard.

8 MS. SOVEREIGN: Madam Chair and Members of  
9 the Board, my name is Katherine Sovereign. I'm a  
10 registered dietician nutritionist, as well as a  
11 registered dental hygienist. In addition to  
12 adults -- to children's teeth, fluoride benefits  
13 adults. Many of us have recession root  
14 sensitivity, xerostomia, which is dry mouth, which  
15 is the result of many medications. And this puts  
16 adults at great risk for dental caries.

17 Untreated dental caries and decay affects  
18 the ability of both children and adults to eat the  
19 health full foods that we recommend so that they  
20 can learn well and have the energy to be productive  
21 and without pain.

22 In response to the aforementioned article  
23 in the Lancet, it has been stated also that the  
24 environmental protection agency and the department  
25 of health and human services base their current

1 recommendations on their own rigorous scientific  
2 assessments and on those of the national academy of  
3 sciences, all of which take into account the  
4 balance of dose, risk and benefits.

5 Please vote to support water fluoridation  
6 of our water as the optimal safe level as  
7 recommended by the CDC. Thank you.

8 MS. CARREON: Elaine Hebbard is our last  
9 speaker.

10 MS. HEBBARD: While we're waiting for the --  
11 so my name is Elaine Hebbard. I'm not going to  
12 talk about fluoride as your last speaker tonight.

13 The water authority just held a series of  
14 customer conversations on infrastructure  
15 reliability and customer service, congratulations,  
16 discussing some of the issues which came up in the  
17 JD Power survey I mentioned in May, as well as the  
18 survey done for the board every two years by  
19 Research & Polling, Inc.

20 While it may be that my representations  
21 to hold customer conversations on this issue did  
22 not play a part, I like to think it did. No  
23 matter. I hope that the outreach will continue and  
24 expand.

25 The recent round of ABC Comprehensive

1 Plan and the water plan updating underscored how  
2 the city and county and the water utility are not  
3 planning together. The new comprehensive plan  
4 nearly excludes the water resources.

5 The water plan reinforces that the entity  
6 is not a land use agency; rather, it is the duty of  
7 the utility to deliver water if the county approves  
8 a land use change. A perfect hole has been  
9 created.

10 There's no responsibility to work  
11 together and to consider cumulative impacts of  
12 various decisions on our water resources. This is  
13 the current situation. It is contrary to the  
14 American planning association's policy guide on  
15 water, which have put a quote up, if anybody can  
16 read it.

17 Basically, leading edge planners are  
18 reaching across the aisle to water managers to help  
19 advise on their comprehensive plans. Not only to  
20 meet environmental objectives, but also to add  
21 value and livability routed in the vision of the  
22 community. This new paradigm of incorporating  
23 water into all aspects of the built environment is  
24 called One Water.

25 We could do this. We could adopt, all

1 three entities could adopt a One Water policy. It  
2 would be in keeping with the -- what's next slide  
3 from last September that John Stomp showed us.

4 And I would suggest that in the adaptive  
5 management approach called for in Policy A is to  
6 identify quantitative objectives or desired  
7 conditions. We could do this.

8 And I finally want to just make a mention  
9 that this is -- next week is World Water Week. The  
10 focus is on water and waste, "Reuse and Reduce."  
11 And I would hope that that would become a priority  
12 of the utility's. Thank you.

13 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: Thank you, Elaine.

14 So that was our final speaker, so next we  
15 will move on to announcements and communication.  
16 The next scheduled meeting for the water authority  
17 is September 20th, 2017, at 5:00 p.m., in the  
18 Vincent E. Griego Chambers.

19 So the next item is Item 7, and this is  
20 the introduction of legislation. So I think it's  
21 part of our process, and correct me if I'm wrong,  
22 Mr. Sanchez, so we typically have two hearings in  
23 order to put it on the agenda to hear these two  
24 bills on the water fluoridation. We would have to  
25 have a motion for immediate action; is that

1 correct?

2 MR. SANCHEZ: Madam Chair, if the desire is  
3 to approve that tonight, that's correct.

4 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: Okay. So -- so in order  
5 to hear this tonight, we need a motion to place  
6 this item on the agenda for immediate action.

7 COMMISSIONER HART STEBBINS: Madam Chair, I  
8 move immediate action on the next two items, which  
9 would be R-17-15 and R-17-16.

10 COMMISSIONER JOHNSON: Second.

11 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: Does it require two votes?  
12 Because I have it here in my notes that we --

13 MR. SANCHEZ: Madam Chair, I believe the --  
14 it's better to have separate votes for each one.

15 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: Okay.

16 COMMISSIONER HART STEBBINS: So, Madam  
17 Chair, would you like me to restate that?

18 THE COURT: Yes.

19 COMMISSIONER HART STEBBINS: Madam Chair, I  
20 move immediate action on R-17-15.

21 COMMISSIONER JOHNSON: Second.

22 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: So there's a motion and a  
23 second on the floor to put R-17-15 for immediate  
24 action. All those in favor, say yes.

25 THREE MEMBERS: Yes.

1 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: Opposed, no.

2 FOUR MEMBERS: No.

3 THE COURT REPORTER: So let's see who voted  
4 no. Please raise your hand. Okay.

5 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: Motion fails.

6 (3-4 vote. Motion failed, with  
7 Commissioner O'Malley, Councillors  
8 Pena and Jones, and Mr. Perry  
9 voting no.)

10 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: So next item, Item B,  
11 which is R-17-16, is there a motion to place this  
12 item on the agenda for immediate action?

13 So there's no motion. So that just  
14 fails. So these two items will be heard at the  
15 next meetings, which I just announced is the  
16 September 20th, 2017, meeting.

17 So this is part of the procedure. So  
18 this is the first hearing. The next meeting will  
19 be other second hearing. So thank you, all for  
20 being here this evening, and thank you for being  
21 respectful of everyone's comments. So next item we  
22 have is the consent agenda, Item AR -- oh, so I  
23 think we're just going to need a motion to approve  
24 if everyone's had an opportunity to look at the  
25 consent agenda, we just need a motion to approve

1 the consent agenda as presented.

2 COMMISSIONER O'MALLEY: So moved.

3 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: There's a motion and a --  
4 is there a second? I'll make the motion to second.  
5 All those in favor, say yes.

6 ALL MEMBERS: Yes.

7 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: Opposed, no.

8 Motion passes.

9 (7-0 vote. Agenda Item 8 approved.)

10 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: Next item, we have  
11 approvals. There are no approvals this evening.  
12 We'll be hearing these two items at the  
13 September 20th meeting.

14 So next item is Item 10, other business,  
15 which is OB-17-8, is the water report by Mr. Carlos  
16 Bustos.

17 MR. BUSTOS: Good evening, Madam Chair,  
18 Members of the Board. I'm here to talk about the  
19 current water usage.

20 As you can see in this graph, we go for  
21 orange, kind of orange-yellow, water represents  
22 usage for 2017; and the blue represents the usage  
23 for 2016. And also you can see some lines. Those  
24 represent the current rainfall; the white being  
25 2017 and the blue being 2016.



1           This is important because it's going to  
2   lead into one of the important topics that we got  
3   in regard to like what it means to have effective  
4   rainfall, use fall rainfall, and how our customers  
5   are behaving in regard to upper irrigation usage.

6           So as after now, we're -- as of  
7   August 13, we use 19.8 billion, which is the same  
8   usage of 2016. So we're on the right track for our  
9   water conservation goals, which is to reduce one  
10   GPCD for the next 20 years every year. Right now,  
11   it's looking like anticipated usage is going to be  
12   128 for the end of the year. The end of usage for  
13   2016 was 31.7 in billions, and our goal is to be  
14   within 30.2, 30.4 billion gallons.

15           So moving onto the next slide, I wanted  
16   to bring the concept of effective rainfall and what  
17   plants need. As you know, most of our usage  
18   happens during the irrigation season. It goes up  
19   three times compared to like a winter average. So  
20   we're really concentrating on educating our  
21   customers to be efficient with outdoor water usage.

22           One of the factors that control that  
23   outdoor water usage, you got your solar energy, you  
24   got rain, and then you got the evapotranspiration.  
25   And then you got also the needs of the plants.

1           As you can see the name in the next  
2 graph, one of the things that's really interesting  
3 is that in 2016, we had an overall rainfall of  
4 9.09 inches across the city that affect the  
5 rainfall. What it means is that the right amount.  
6 If it's too little, it's not going to get to the  
7 root zone. If it's too much, it's going to be --  
8 result in runoff.

9           So that's what we're talking about  
10 effective rainfall. And that's a concept that  
11 we're trying to get across for our customers. When  
12 it rains, how much water does your landscape really  
13 need. And as you can see, it varies throughout the  
14 year.

15           Not only it varies across the year. One  
16 of the things that, as we all know, is that it also  
17 varies around the city. Most of the weather  
18 results that we get are from the airport station.  
19 For 2016, that ended up being on the 2.14 inches.  
20 But as you can see as you move closer to the  
21 mountains, it was almost -- it was closer to  
22 5 inches. So it all depends on where you are in  
23 the city.

24           The good news is that we're moving in the  
25 direction of more rainfall for the next -- next

1 coming months. And with that, we're hoping that  
2 customers continue responding to that rainfall  
3 event. So more rainfall, more effective rainfall,  
4 less need to irrigate your landscape. And just  
5 coming back to the first graph, I want to refer to  
6 something.

7 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: So Mr. Bustos, are you  
8 telling us that we need to buy some water  
9 harvesting barrels?

10 MR. BUSTOS: Yes. Yes. Please do. And we  
11 got available rebates for that, so...

12 One thing to do, to see, and, you know  
13 when we really got that hot spell that resulted in  
14 almost 145 million gallons, so we're -- compared to  
15 the last couple -- last couple years, that's a good  
16 thing, customers responded. It got really hot,  
17 plants have needs, landscaping have needs. And we  
18 want those landscapes to be healthy. So customers  
19 responded by irrigating and using more water. And  
20 as you can see in June, as soon as we started  
21 getting those overcast days and more clouds, even  
22 though it resulted in less rainfall, customers also  
23 responded. And as we're noticing in August, we're  
24 starting to see those numbers to go down.

25 So in my role as a water conservation

1 program manager, this is good to see. So thank  
2 you, our customers. I stand for questions.

3 THE COURT: Any questions?

4 No. Thank you. I'm going to go buy one.  
5 So anyone else?

6 COMMISSIONER O'MALLEY: Customers do  
7 respond.

8 MR. BUSTOS: They do, yes.

9 COMMISSIONER O'MALLEY: I mean, we have a  
10 lot of folks who, if they -- we need to conserve,  
11 people, they step it up and they start to conserve.

12 MR. BUSTOS: Yes, yes.

13 COMMISSIONER O'MALLEY: So good for us,  
14 Albuquerque. Thank you.

15 MR. BUSTOS: All right. Thank you.

16 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: Thank you, Mr. Bustos.

17 MR. BUSTOS: Have a good night.

18 CHAIRWOMAN PENA: And with no further  
19 business, this meeting is adjourned. Thank you,  
20 all for being here.

21 (Proceedings adjourned at 6:30 p.m.)

22

23

24

25

1 STATE OF NEW MEXICO  
2 COUNTY OF BERNALILLO

3

4

5 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE

6 I, Paul Baca, New Mexico Certified Court  
7 Reporter, No. 112, do hereby certify that I  
8 reported the foregoing proceedings in stenographic  
9 shorthand and the pages are a true and correct  
10 transcript of those proceedings and were reduced to  
11 printed form under my direct supervision.

12 I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am neither  
13 employed by nor related to any of the parties or  
14 attorneys in this case and that I have no interest  
15 in the final disposition of this case.

16

17

18 \_\_\_\_\_  
PAUL BACA  
Certified Court Reporter No. 112  
19 License Expires: 12/31/17

20

21

22

23

24

25